

Community Participation in the Implementation of Regional Government in Indonesia

Kurhayadi

Sekolah Tinggi Ilmu Administrasi Bandung, Indonesia

Email: kurhayadi@stiabandung.ac.id

Abstract

In carrying out their duties, Regional Governments generally carry out their work for the benefit of the community. However, sometimes the work of the local government does not always follow the needs of the community itself. Therefore, the community can then participate in the implementation of Regional Government. This research then aims to see how participation from the community can be carried out in the implementation of regional government. This research will be carried out using a descriptive qualitative approach. The data used in this study comes from various previous studies and studies regarding community participation in local government. The results of this study then found that community participation has been regulated explicitly in the Regional Government Law. In this Law, it is explained that the regional government needs to involve the community in the planning process as well as in the implementation of development. The form of public participation in government administration follows the principles contained in good governance.

Keywords: *Community Participation, Local Government, Law.*



A. INTRODUCTION

Participation of the populace in all developmental processes represents a fundamental entitlement of individuals, safeguarded by the constitution, as articulated in Section 28C(2) of the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia (1945 UUDNRI). Varied manifestations of community engagement, commencing with the dissemination of information, followed by consultations, dialogues, idea exchanges, deliberations, the expression of viewpoints, and interpersonal interactions, all constitute inherent rights of citizens, underscored and upheld by the 1945 UUDNRI, as indicated in Section 28E(3) and 28F of the 1945 UUDNRI (Susanti & Sari, 2021).

Each developmental endeavor should result in Pareto superiority, generating advantages for all stakeholders, particularly the community, rather than pursuing Pareto optimality, which entails progress achieved at the cost of others. The main goal of development is to achieve the prosperity and welfare of Indonesian citizens (*Ibid*). There is no point in developing a nation when such development causes misery for the community (Anwar & Dong, 2022).

In executing development initiatives, the engagement of community involvement holds great significance. Through community participation, the planning procedures and outcomes can inherently align with the actual requirements. Given that the aim of development is to enhance communal well-being, it is only logical for the community to play a role in the developmental processes. In essence, the necessity

of community participation throughout the entirety of development implementation cannot be understated (Leal Filho et al., 2019).

In order to expedite the achievement of public welfare, it becomes imperative to undertake diverse measures aimed at augmenting the involvement of the public in regional governance. This constitutes the focal point of the guidelines pertaining to public participation, as stipulated in Law No. 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, henceforth denoted as the Regional Government Law (Uittenbroek et al., 2019).

The involvement of the community in regional governance holds a significant role, including serving as a channel for individuals, community collectives, and social entities to articulate their requirements and concerns. This facilitates a more adaptive shaping of regional policies, ensuring they align closely with the community's needs and interests (Zhuang et al., 2019). Community involvement also holds importance in materializing community interest and fostering support for successful regional development. As outlined in Article 354 paragraph (7) of the Regional Government Law, the mechanisms for community participation in regional governance are subsequently detailed in Regional Regulations (Perda) in accordance with Government Regulations (Hiriart-Bertrand et al., 2020).

The principles for community involvement are outlined in Government Regulation No. 45 of 2017 concerning the Engagement of Communities in Regional Government Operations. This encompasses community participation in activities such as formulating Regional Regulations and policies, strategizing, budgeting, executing, overseeing, and assessing regional development endeavors, overseeing regional assets and natural resources, providing public services, granting public access to information regarding Regional Government operations, and reinforcing the capability of community entities and organizations to enable their effective contribution to regional governance (Roxas et al., 2020).

The implementation of Government Regulation No. 45 of 2017 ensures the assurance of the community's entitlement to engage in the formulation of regional regulations, particularly those that pertain to the community's regulations and responsibilities. The regional regulations and regional policies that regulate and burden the community are usually regional regulations regarding spatial planning, regional taxes, regional levies, regional development planning and budgeting, permits, regulations that impose sanctions on the community, and other regulations that have social impacts (Putri et al., 2022).

Starting from the description stated above, at least it has opened up space for the author to examine more deeply all matters related to the urgency of community participation in the current implementation of Regional Government.

B. LITERATURE REVIEW

1. Community Participation

As expressed by Dr. Made Pidarta, participation denotes the engagement of an individual or a group of individuals in an endeavor. This engagement encompasses

both cognitive and emotional elements, along with physical participation, wherein individuals proactively employ their skills (initiating action) in all conducted activities, contributing to goal attainment, and assuming accountability for their contributions. Participation involves the cognitive and emotional engagement of an individual within a collective setting, motivating them to bolster the group's objectives and bear the group's responsibilities (Kil et al., 2021).

In Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 5 of 2007, it is outlined that participation embodies the dynamic engagement and inclusion of the community within the developmental planning procedure. Participation signifies the assessment of each individual's disposition and engagement in alignment with the organization's circumstances, ultimately motivating the individual to contribute towards accomplishing organizational objectives and partake in collective responsibilities (Bikaako et al., 2022).

Community participation, also known as citizen participation, refers to a procedure in which citizens, both as individuals and as collective social entities or organizations, actively engage and exert influence over the phases of policy formulation, execution, and surveillance that directly impact their livelihoods (McCarron et al., 2023). As defined by Pasaribu and Simanjuntak, community participation entails the active involvement of the community, wherein they align with and support the government's efforts. Historically, the government has primarily assumed the roles of initiator, coordinator, and funder in development activities. The community's engagement is anticipated as it's facilitated and funded primarily by the government, with the overarching goal of optimizing the well-being of the individuals themselves and the broader population (Simanjuntak et al., 2023).

Gordon posits that participation results in a level of engagement that transcends mere work or task involvement. This entails a deeper connection involving both cognitive and emotional dimensions, where thoughts and feelings are engaged. On the other hand, Keith Davis defines participation as the cognitive immersion of one's thoughts and emotional sentiments within a group context, fostering a desire to contribute towards the group's objectives and bear responsibility for the pertinent endeavors. In parallel, Alastair White asserts that participation embodies the energetic engagement of the local community in decision-making and the execution of developmental undertakings meant for the community's betterment (Huang et al., 2023).

The effective realization of regional autonomy is intricately linked to the vibrant engagement of community constituents. The regional community, both as a system unit and as an individual, is a very important integral part of the government system because in principle regional administration is aimed at creating a prosperous society in the area concerned (Retnandari, 2022). The notion of community participation is intimately tied to the concept of democracy, aligning with the foundational democratic principle of "by the people, for the people." This principle aims to provide each citizen with the opportunity to advance within the societal framework. Consequently, it seeks to negate inherent privileges and champions the

pursuit of societal distinction based solely on individual abilities, in accordance with legal standards (Muradova et al., 2020).

Bintoro Tjokroamidjojo emphasized that development which covers all aspects of life, politics, economy, and socio-culture will only be successful if it is an activity that involves the participation of all people in a country. As per W.W Rostow, the concept of development follows a linear trajectory, progressing from less developed societies to eventually achieving the status of developed nations. Additionally, Rogers proposes that development constitutes a beneficial transformation towards a socio-economic framework aligned with the collective aspirations of a nation (Purnamawati et al., 2023).

2. Regional Government

Government is defined with both a comprehensive and a specific connotation. In a comprehensive context, government encompasses all branches of authority within the state, encompassing the legislative, executive, and judicial divisions. In fact, in this broad sense, the government is defined as carrying out the duties of all agencies and institutions entrusted with the authority to achieve state goals (Hariyanto, 2022). In an expansive interpretation, the government is commonly referred to as "Regering." Nonetheless, in a more specific interpretation, the government (termed as "Bestuur") pertains solely to the arrangement of duties executed by entities engaged in governmental responsibilities, predominantly the executive functions managed by the cabinet and its personnel, spanning from the central to the regional tiers (Saputra & Widayati, 2020).

The government is nothing but an organization that regulates and administers state affairs. Without a government, it is hard to imagine a country can run well. The government's functions include: enforcing the law, enacting regional regulations, and harmonizing conflicting societal interests so that they can carry out their functions properly and effectively, the government can use the legal attributes of the state, namely sovereignty. Because of this, the government sometimes holds a monopoly on carrying out physical coercion legally so in situations like this, the assumption arises that the government is synonymous with the state (Xin & Huang, 2022).

The state can also be interpreted as a human organization or group of people, who are under the same government. This government is a tool to act in the interests of the people to achieve the goals of state organizations, including welfare, defense, security, order, justice, health, and others (Crawford & Schultz, 2019). To be able to act as well as possible to achieve these goals, the government has the authority, which authority is distributed again to the instruments of state power so that each sector of the state's goals can be carried out simultaneously. Concerning this division of authority, there is a distribution of state tasks to the instruments of state power (LaMonaca & Ryan, 2022).

The administration of regional government in Indonesia is based on the provisions of Article 18 of the 1945 Constitution which states that: "The Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia is divided into provincial regions and the provincial

regions are divided into regencies and cities, each of which has a regional government which is regulated by law" (Din & Yasa' Abubakar, 2021).

Meanwhile, Article 18 paragraph (5) of the 1945 Constitution stipulates that a regional government constitutes an independent jurisdiction capable of administering governmental matters to the fullest extent, possessing the authority to manage governmental powers, excluding matters designated by legislation as the domain of the central government (Haruni, 2022).

Regional governance involves the management of self-governing regional authorities carried out by both the regional government and the Regional People's Representative Council (DPRD), guided by the principle of decentralization. "Regency/city regional governments have the authority to appoint, transfer, dismiss, determine pensions, salaries, benefits, and employee welfare" (Suparto, 2021).

In Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government Article 1 paragraph 2 states that: "Regional government is the implementation of government affairs by the regional government and the Regional People's Representative Council according to the principle of autonomy and co-administration with the principle of broadest autonomy in the system and principles the unitary state of the Republic of Indonesia as referred to in the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia". In light of the provided definition, "regional government" pertains to the execution of autonomous regions through the collaborative efforts of the regional government and DPRD in accordance with the principles of decentralization. This approach contrasts with centralization. The key components of regional government administration encompass governors, regents or mayors, and the regional administrative apparatus (Wyn Edwards & Wisthaler, 2023).

C. METHOD

This study adopts a qualitative approach using the literature study method to explain aspects of community participation in local government. The data used comes from previous studies, literature studies, and the relevance of related laws. The data were then analyzed using a qualitative approach, involving identifying thematic patterns and developing key concepts related to community participation in local government. This literature study method is expected to be able to provide comprehensive insights about community participation in local government, which in turn can enrich public administration discussions and practices that focus on inclusiveness and responsiveness to the interests of local communities.

D. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

1. Building Public Awareness to Participate in Regional Government Administration

Humans are social creatures (*zoon politicon*) who must live together and form a group called society, in which this does not happen based on the existence of humans who coincidentally get together, but is based on a common goal, among others, to fulfill their calling in life, meet their needs or interests. Only in living together is it

possible for humans to fulfill their life's vocation, and meet their needs or interests. Since being imaged as social being, humans cannot live outside the network of orders, how and whatever form they take. Sociality confirms that humans are group creatures, such as ants, bees, and others. But if the ant community is natural, it can be said that the network of human structures is man-made, artificial. Problems immediately arise from this artificial order. Law is an order that is intentionally made by humans and is also deliberately imposed on them.

The social order in Indonesia is so diverse and complex that special wisdom and prudence are needed to take care of it. If these warnings are not heeded, then for many local communities, national law will become more of a burden than creating order and prosperity. In societal contexts, individuals require safeguarding of their interests. This safeguarding is attained by establishing guidelines or codes of conduct that outline how individuals should interact within society, minimizing harm to both others and themselves.

Therefore, we need a law that can accept local realities that exist in society. By accepting these local realities, the community feels valued, needed, and expected for their role in building the nation which leads to their active participation in the administration of regional governance. Rules of law and development systems in the regions should be adopted from local wisdom, that is, taken from structures that have lived and developed in society. Adoption of rules from local wisdom is carried out with a bottom-up planning system, namely development planning that originates from growing aspirations from the lowest level of society. This model of development system requires community participation, meaning that community participation is important to get the regional development model that the community wants.

This pattern of development contains the principles of decentralization and local democracy. The principle of decentralization relates to the placement of districts/cities as autonomous development areas that have the authority to manage development planning and implementation in their jurisdiction. Meanwhile, the principles of democracy are spelled out in community participation in every plan. Through this concept of empowerment, the government developed a strategy to start increasing community participation both in the process and in the implementation of development. This development policy adheres to two basic philosophies, namely public touch and bringing the public in, namely a policy that really touches the needs of the public and is also able to bring the community into policy spaces or what is known as participatory development. This kind of development policy model is currently being promoted by the government.

The clarification provided by Government Regulation No. 45 of 2017 underscores the vital role of community engagement in regional governance. This role encompasses serving as a platform for various segments of the community – individuals, community collectives, and social entities – to voice their requirements and concerns. This facilitates the crafting of regional policies that are closely aligned with the community's needs and interests. Furthermore, community participation

holds significance in translating community apprehensions into tangible backing for effective regional development within the area.

As per H. S. Tisnanta, the extent of people's (community) involvement in the execution of Regional Government hinges significantly on the caliber of the relationship between the government and the citizens. Given that the government possesses authoritative power, it becomes imperative for the government to genuinely create avenues and possibilities for citizens to partake in the formulation of policies. Meanwhile, M. Budairi Idjehar stated that opportunities for the people may only be available if the institutions in society guarantee 8 (eight) conditions, namely: Freedom to form and join organizations; Freedom of expression; The right to vote in general elections; The right to occupy public office; The right of leaders to compete for votes; Availability of alternative sources of information; The holding of free and honest general elections; some institutions guarantee that public policy depends on votes in general elections and on how opinions are expressed.

The eight conditions mentioned above will have implications for the opening of space for public participation in governance broadly. With the opening of the space for participation, decision-making involving the community cannot be monopolized by decision-making officials or members of representative institutions but must be widely opened in a climate of openness. The existence of representative institutions will never be able to listen to all the demands of society. Many important decisions in administering government must involve the community directly.

Active community participation and engagement in the formulation of public policies, public policy programs, and decision-making procedures is a hallmark of a democratic governance system. Furthermore, the extensive implementation of regional autonomy offers a substantial avenue for community inclusion in regional government management, particularly in the creation of regional regulations.

Involving the community in shaping regional regulations exemplifies good governance in alignment with the core principles of community engagement, accountability, and transparency. As stated by Miftah Thoha, achieving this hinges on the application of good governance. To effectively attain this, establishing and executing a suitable, transparent, and tangible accountability structure is essential. This facilitates efficient, effective, ethical, and responsible governance and development practices, ensuring they remain untainted by corruption.

According to Alexander Abe, direct community involvement will have three important impacts, namely: First, avoiding opportunities for interest manipulation to occur; Second, clarifying what the community wants and needs; Third, adding value to the legitimacy of planning formulations, in this case, the more community participation involved, the better; Fourth, increase community awareness and skills.

2. Scope and Form of Community Participation

Executing democratic practices within regional governance is a role assumed by the Regional Head in the execution of their responsibilities and powers. The Regional Head serves as the government's leader, carrying out their duties within the

regional administration while adhering to democratic tenets. Regional Government according to democratic principles is organized based on the principles of accountability, transparency, based on law, and people's participation. Regional Government according to the principle of accountability, namely being able to account for all activities of government actions to the people in the region.

The complete establishment of public participation in the management of democratic governance is not yet comprehensively outlined within Indonesian legal frameworks. This uncertainty has led to ambiguity regarding the community's involvement in the Regional Head's role in overseeing democratic regional autonomy. Consequently, to address these ambiguous norms, an evaluation of the community's role in the functions of a democratic Regional Head is undertaken in accordance with existing laws and regulations.

In the explanatory section of Government Regulation No. 45 of 2017, it is emphasized that to expedite the achievement of societal well-being, diverse measures should be taken to enhance public engagement in regional governance. This constitutes the central theme for the regulation of public participation within this specific Government Regulation, as mandated by the provisions of Law No. 23 of 2014 regarding the Regional Government.

Arrangements for community participation in PP No. 45 of 2017 include, among others:

- a. Community participation in the preparation of Regional Regulations and Regional Policies that regulate and burden the community;
Government Regulation No. 45 of 2017 ensures the community's entitlement to engage in the formulation of regional regulations and policies that impact and affect the community. Simultaneously, the Regional Government is obligated to enhance public involvement in the creation of Regional Regulations and Regional Policies.
- b. Community participation in planning, budgeting, implementing, monitoring, and evaluating regional development;
Communities in the form of community groups and community organizations must appoint and have their representatives participate in the administration of the Regional Government. Community participation can also be carried out by individuals. Community participation is carried out through conveying aspirations, public consultations, discussions, and/or deliberations which are carried out per statutory provisions. The results of community participation are used as input in the preparation of regional development plans. To increase public participation, dissemination is carried out through information system media, print, and electronic media, and even by utilizing bulletin boards
- c. Community Participation in the Management of Regional Assets and/or Natural Resources
Engagement of the community in the utilization of regional assets and/or natural resources can take various forms, including leasing, utilization

collaboration, maintenance collaboration, and infrastructure provisioning collaboration, all in accordance with legal regulations.

- d. Public Participation in the Implementation of Public Services
Community involvement in the management of public services encompasses the complete procedure of overseeing public services within the framework of regional governance. Such participation adheres to legal regulations as stipulated by the law.
- e. Public Access to Information on Regional Government Administration
Public access to information concerning the execution of Regional Government is executed in accordance with established laws and regulations. This access to information is facilitated through the following methods:
 - 1). Information systems, print/electronic media, and/or bulletin boards provided by the Regional Government;
 - 2). Requesting information directly from the Regional Government in accordance with the community's requirements.
- f. Strengthening the Capacity of Community Groups and/or Community Organizations
The Regional Government offers assistance to enhance the capabilities of community groups and/or community organizations, enabling them to engage productively in regional governance. This capacity-building aid is dispensed through counseling, education, training, and mentorship, all in accordance with established legal regulations.

3. Government Efforts to Encourage Community Participation in Regional Government Administration

To foster the establishment of a competitive society, it's essential to undertake comprehensive, forward-looking, and sustainable community empowerment initiatives. The executed empowerment strategies involve harmonizing government and other stakeholders' efforts in program planning while taking into account prevailing social norms and indigenous knowledge.

The government has undertaken diverse measures to promote community engagement in regional development initiatives. Within regional development planning, the Regional Government actively fosters community participation in long-term regional development planning, medium-term regional development planning, as well as annual regional development planning.

Article 354 paragraph (2) of the Regional Government Law outlines that for the establishment of Regional Government, the Regional Government stimulates community participation through various activities, including:

- a. Conveying information on the administration of Regional Government Regulations to the public;
- b. Stimulating community groups and organizations to assume an active role in regional governance by facilitating community capacity-building support;

- c. Establishing institutional and decision-making mechanisms that empower community groups and organizations for effective engagement;
- d. Other activities follow the provisions of the legislation.

Meanwhile PP No. 45 of 2017 emphasized that to succeed in regional development, the Regional Government is obliged to encourage community participation in regional long-term development planning in the form of activities including:

- a. Formulating the preliminary version of the regional long-term development plan;
- b. Deliberations on long-term development planning.

Further elaboration indicates that the Regional Government additionally promotes community involvement in devising regional medium-term development plans, which encompasses activities such as:

- a. Preparation of the initial draft of the regional medium-term development plan;
- b. Compilation of regional apparatus strategic plans;
- c. Deliberation on medium-term development planning.

The Regional Government fosters public engagement in formulating preliminary policy drafts for regional revenue and expenditure budgets, alongside setting priorities and provisional budget limits for regional development allocation. Community participation takes the form of expressing aspirations, conducting public consultations, and/or discussions, all conducted following established legal guidelines. The outcomes of these engagements serve as input for creating preliminary policy drafts related to regional revenue and expenditure budgets, as well as priorities and temporary budget ceilings.

In the compilation of regional annual development plans, the Regional Government promotes community participation through the following activities:

- a. Preparation of the initial draft of the Regional Government work plan;
- b. Preparation of work plans for regional apparatuses;
- c. Deliberations on regional development planning in the sub-districts;
- d. Provincial and district/city annual development planning meetings.

In facilitating regional development, the Regional Government promotes community involvement through partnerships. Community participation in regional development can be enacted through grants from the community to the Regional Government in the shape of monetary contributions, goods, and/or services, all within the framework of established legal provisions.

The Regional Government promotes community engagement in the oversight of regional natural assets and/or resources, encompassing their utilization, exploitation, safeguarding, and maintenance. Community involvement in the use and protection of regional assets and natural resources is conducted through supervisory mechanisms as outlined by established legal regulations.

E. CONCLUSION

The Regional Government Law has explicitly regulated everything related to Regional Government including community participation. The provisions concerning community participation are extensively delineated in Government Regulation No. 45 of 2017. This regulation elucidates that in the execution of Regional Government, involving the community's participation is vital, assigning them roles in both the planning process and developmental implementation. Engaging the public in the formulation of regional regulations embodies good governance in adherence to good governance principles. Community participation in Regional Government implementation encompasses various aspects, including the creation of Regional Regulations and Regional Policies that impact the community, as well as activities such as planning, budgeting, execution, monitoring, evaluation of regional development, management of regional assets and natural resources, and the provision of public services. To ensure the success of Regional Government implementation, the Regional Government facilitates community participation through disseminating information regarding Regional Government administration to the community, fostering active engagement of community groups and organizations in Regional Government through supporting capacity building, and establishing mechanisms for institutionalization and decision-making that empower these groups and organizations for effective engagement.

REFERENCES

1. Anwar, G. A., & Dong, Y. (2022). Surrogate-based decision-making of community building portfolios under uncertain consequences and risk attitudes. *Engineering Structures*, 268, 114749.
2. Bikaako, W., Kabahango, P., Mugabi, K., Yawe, A., Stallon, K., Kyewalabye, E., ... & Amuguni, H. (2022). Breaking institutional barriers to enhance women's participation in and benefit from the Peste des Petits Ruminants and Newcastle Disease vaccine value chains for Sembabule district of Uganda. *Plos one*, 17(10), e0270518.
3. Crawford, K., & Schultz, J. (2019). AI systems as state actors. *Columbia Law Review*, 119(7), 1941-1972.
4. Din, M., & Yasa'Abubakar, A. (2021). The Position of the Qanun Jinayat as a Forum for the Implementation of Sharia in Aceh in the Indonesian Constitution. *Samarah: Jurnal Hukum Keluarga dan Hukum Islam*, 5(2), 689-709.
5. Hariyanto, H. (2022). Implications of State Policy Through Village Funds Towards the Cultural Values of Mutual Cooperation in the Village. *De Lega Lata: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum*, 7(1), 46-64.
6. Haruni, C. W. (2022). Constitutionality of monitoring and evaluation of regional regulation drafts and regional regulations by Regional Representative Council. *Legality: Jurnal Ilmiah Hukum*, 30(1), 103-115.

7. Hiriart-Bertrand, L., Silva, J. A., & Gelcich, S. (2020). Challenges and opportunities of implementing the marine and coastal areas for indigenous peoples policy in Chile. *Ocean & Coastal Management*, 193, 105233.
8. Huang, Y., Gan, X., Jin, X., Rao, S., Guo, B., He, Z., & Wei, Z. (2023). The relationship between the Dark Triad and bullying among Chinese adolescents: the role of social exclusion and sense of control. *Frontiers in psychology*, 14, 1173860.
9. Kil, N., Stein, T. V., Holland, S. M., Kim, J. J., Kim, J., & Petitte, S. (2021). The role of place attachment in recreation experience and outcome preferences among forest bathers. *Journal of Outdoor Recreation and Tourism*, 35, 100410.
10. LaMonaca, S., & Ryan, L. (2022). The state of play in electric vehicle charging services—A review of infrastructure provision, players, and policies. *Renewable and sustainable energy reviews*, 154, 111733.
11. Leal Filho, W., Skanavis, C., Kounani, A., Brandli, L. L., Shiel, C., do Paco, A., ... & Shula, K. (2019). The role of planning in implementing sustainable development in a higher education context. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 235, 678-687.
12. McCarron, A., Semple, S., Braban, C. F., Swanson, V., Gillespie, C., & Price, H. D. (2023). Public engagement with air quality data: Using health behaviour change theory to support exposure-minimising behaviours. *Journal of Exposure Science & Environmental Epidemiology*, 33(3), 321-331.
13. Muradova, L., Walker, H., & Colli, F. (2020). Climate change communication and public engagement in interpersonal deliberative settings: Evidence from the Irish citizens' assembly. *Climate Policy*, 20(10), 1322-1335.
14. Purnamawati, I. G. A., Yuniarta, G. A., & Jie, F. (2023). Strengthening the role of corporate social responsibility in the dimensions of sustainable village economic development. *Heliyon*, 9(4).
15. Putri, E. I. K., Dharmawan, A. H., Hospes, O., Yulian, B. E., Amalia, R., Mardiyansih, D. I., ... & Suradiredja, D. Y. (2022). The oil palm governance: challenges of sustainability policy in Indonesia. *Sustainability*, 14(3), 1820.
16. Retnandari, N. D. (2022). Implementation of strategic planning in regional/municipal governments, obstacles and challenges. *Policy & Governance Review*, 6(2), 155-175.
17. Roxas, F. M. Y., Rivera, J. P. R., & Gutierrez, E. L. M. (2020). Mapping stakeholders' roles in governing sustainable tourism destinations. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management*, 45, 387-398.
18. Saputra, A. H., & Widayati, W. (2020). Juridical Study on Implementation of Village Chairman Using E-Voting Method. *Law Development Journal*, 2(3), 392-401.
19. Simanjuntak, D. F., Kusumawati, R. L., Bader, O., Lüder, C. G., Zimmermann, O., & Groß, U. (2023). A comparative pilot study on Gram-negative bacteria contaminating the hands of children living in urban and rural areas of Indonesia versus Germany—A suitable monitoring strategy for diarrhea risk assessment?. *Frontiers in Microbiology*, 14, 1152411.
20. Suparto, S. (2021). The Position and Function of the Regional Representative Council in Constitutional System of Indonesia According to the Regional

Autonomy Laws: A Shift from Legislative to Regional Executive. *UNIFIKASI: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum*, 8(1), 53-69.

21. Susanti, P., & Sari, R. (2021). Government responsibility for the fulfillment basic rights of unprosperous people in education sector. *Substantive Justice International Journal of Law*, 4(1), 47-59.

22. Uittenbroek, C. J., Mees, H. L., Hegger, D. L., & Driessen, P. P. (2019). The design of public participation: who participates, when and how? Insights in climate adaptation planning from the Netherlands. *Journal of Environmental Planning and Management*, 62(14), 2529-2547.

23. Wyn Edwards, C., & Wisthaler, V. (2023). The power of symbolic sanctuary: insights from Wales on the limitations and potential of a regional approach to sanctuary. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 49(14), 3602-3628.

24. Xin, G., & Huang, J. (2022). Party building in an unlikely place? The adaptive presence of the chinese communist party in the non-governmental organizations (NGO). *Journal of Contemporary China*, 31(135), 428-444.

25. Zhuang, T., Qian, Q. K., Visscher, H. J., Elsinga, M. G., & Wu, W. (2019). The role of stakeholders and their participation network in decision-making of urban renewal in China: The case of Chongqing. *Cities*, 92, 47-58.