

# GENDER EQUALITY IN THE PROMOTION OF CIVIL SERVANTS SERVICES IN THE GOVERNMENT OF WEST JAVA PROVINCE

Sri Hartati<sup>1</sup>, Nurliah Nurdin<sup>2</sup>, Tjahya Supriatna<sup>3</sup>, Ismail Nurdin<sup>4</sup> & Dedeh Maryani<sup>5</sup>

<sup>12345</sup>Institut Pemerintahan Dalam Negeri

Email: srihartatiipdn@gmail.com

## Abstract

*This study aims to analyze gender equality in the promotion of structural positions in the Government of West Java Province. This research design uses qualitative methods with data collection techniques in the form of in-depth interviews and documentation studies. While the research analysis technique is done by data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing. The results of the study concluded that gender equality in the promotion of structural positions in West Java Province had not been realized optimally because the competency, qualifications, and work behavior of female civil servants are considered lower than men. Various servants faced by female civil servants for good promotion internal factors, namely the dual role and lack of motivation of women to progress, also obstacles to external factors stemming from the family, community, and organizational culture that are not gendered responsive. In addition to competence, qualifications, and work behavior, other considerations were found for the promotion of the position of a female civil servant, namely: multiple roles, type of work and location of assignments; this made women less likely to get strategic position promotions.*

**Keywords:** gender equality, promotion, job performance, competence.

## A. INTRODUCTION

Pancasila and the 1945 Constitution, Article 27 (1) and Article 28 D (3) provides rights equal for men and women to participate in the implementation of development and enjoy the fruits of growth, including the construction of the apparatus of government. The same opportunity without discrimination to get a job is also mandated in Labor Law No. 13 of 2003 (5). The same right to vote, be elected and be appointed in jobs, positions, and professions are guaranteed by Law Number 39 of 1999 concerning Human Rights article 49 (1). Gender equality in a global perspective became an international agreement at the UN General Assembly session on December 17, 1979, that approved the *Convention of Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW)* and the *Beijing Declaration and Platform for Platform Action (BDPA)* 1995, which established Gender Mainstreaming (PUG) as the Country Development Strategy included in various development planning documents, both at national and global levels.

The struggle and awakening of Indonesian women's awareness to take part in the public sphere began at the first Indonesian Women's Congress in 1928. This congress played a role in increasing opportunities for Indonesian women to participate in the development, especially in the political field. As a result of the first general election in 1955, there were 6.5 % female parliamentarians (Parawansa, 2002). Furthermore, to increase the role of women in the political field, the government issued Law Number 31 of 2002, which was amended by Law Number 2 of 2008 concerning Political Parties, which states that Political Parties include women representatives of at least 30 % in their establishment and management at the level central and Law No. 12 of 2003, as amended by Act No. 10 of 2008 on Election of member of DPR, DPD, and DPRD, which regulates political party can only follow the electoral after

fulfilling requirements include at least 30% representation of women on the management of political parties at the central level. While it has issued some policies to enhance the role of women in the political sphere, but in fact, the political representation of women in the Indonesian parliament has reached the highest rate of 17.86% at the general election in 2009 (w [www.kpu.go.id](http://www.kpu.go.id), nd).

Not only in the legislature, in the institute judicative representation of women is figure is still low, namely the composition of the image of 12 % in the Supreme Court, 11 % in the Constitutional Court, 14% in the Judicial Commission and the Election Commission. Then out of 142 BUMNs in Indonesia and 650 directorships, women only occupy around 5%. The representation of women in the position of Minister / Deputy Minister has only reached 14 % of 56 Ministers / Deputy Ministers or Ministerial level (LAN, 2016)

P no executive agency of women who occupy positions are still minimal advance in strategic locations. Society For Elections and Democracy (Perludem) noted that there are only 31 people women (9, 06 %) of a total of 342 people who were chosen as regional head and deputy regional head. A total of 14 women were elected as regional heads, and 17 women were elected as regional deputy heads. These women are brave in 31 regions namely, in 3 provinces: 1 governor, two deputy governors; in 19 districts: 10 regents, nine representative regents; and in 9 cities : 3 mayors, six deputy mayors ( [Tribunnews.com](http://Tribunnews.com), 22 March 2019)

Of the group of professionals servant Civil Affairs (ASN/PNS), the Central Bureau of Statistics noted in 2016 the number of civil servants in Indonesia amounted to 4,373,349 people, composed of men amounted to 2,217,493 votes (50.68%) and women 2.1 56 856 ( 49.32%), with composition occupying structural positions: Echelon I as much as 9%, Echelon II as much as 7%, Echelon III as much as 16% and Echelon IV as much as 25%.

Legally there are no obstacles for women to take part in the field of government. As stipulated in Law Number 5 Year 2014 concerning State Civil Apparatus article 72, both female and male civil servants are given the same rights and opportunities to develop their careers through promotion. The ASN Law was followed up with PP Number 11 of 2017 concerning the Management of Public Servants. Article 162 emphasized, " Promotion is the management of civil servant careers carried out by applying the Merit system." But in reality, in the promotion of position, there is still a reasonably large gap between women and men. Female civil servants are always positioned as subordinates of male civil servants so that in the promotion of positions more dominated by male civil servants.

Conditions of gender inequality in the promotion of positions in the government environment occur at the central government down to the level of local government, and one of them is the Government of West Java Province. The realization of gender equality in the Province of West Java has not been drawn from the Gender Empowerment Index (IDG), which is still below the national IDG average, as measured by the extent of women's active involvement and role in the social, economic and political sectors. (including the civil servant profession). Nationally, IDG Indonesia is at level 71, 74, and only eight provinces have been able to surpass national IDG achievements (23.53%). It is ironic, 26 areas have IDG below national numbers, including West Java. The IDG of West Java province in 2017 was 70.04 (Indah Lukita sari, Anugrah Pambudi Raharjo, & Dina Nur Rahmawati ', 2018).

Civil Servants in West Java Province, quantitatively not far adrift between men and women. According to data from the West Java Province Regional Civil Service Agency, the number of civil servants as of October 2019 was 37,336 people, 20,262 men (54.3 %), and 17,074 women (45.7%). From these data, female civil servants who occupy structural positions can be seen in the following table:

**Table 1**  
**Total Structural West Java Province at by Sex**

NO	Echelon	Pr	Percentage (%)	Lk	Percentage (%)	Number of Positions
1	Ib	-	0	1	100	1
2	II.a	4	10	37	90	41
3	II.b	5	56	4	44	9
4	III.a	61	29	147	71	208
5	III.b	33	21	123	79	156
6	IV.a	297	44	589	66	886
7	IV.b	119	31	266	69	385
<b>amount</b>		<b>519</b>	<b>31</b>	<b>1166</b>	<b>69</b>	<b>1685</b>

Source: BKD West Java Province, 2019

Female civil servants occupy 31 %, and men hold 69 % of the total 1685 structural position formations. P omen more placed on the post of superintendent ( Echelon IV ) and the pillar of administrator ( echelon III ). At the same time, the positions located in high leadership positions Pratama, especially echelon II / A is only 10%. The higher the area, the lower the status of women. Role of women in decision making at the institution government still relatively small, the article structural officers dominated by male civil servants (Beautiful Lukita Sari et al., 2018)

Their stereotype sexes in a bureaucratic environment of West Java Province is reflected in the position of PNS p omen that was under subordinate of men, women only as "complementary" (*the second sex and the second position* ). Patriarchal culture is still dominant in influencing the organizational culture so that it raises the perception that the leader must be a person who has a strong, brave, aggressive (masculine) character, and that trait is identical to men. Whereas women are considered to be "weak" (feminine) figures so that it raises the stigma of women being unable to carry out tasks optimally.

## THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

### Gender equality

The issue of equality of gender arises with increasing public awareness that there has been an imbalance between men and women in a shared life that is inequality, injustice received by women. "The term gender equality is often associated with terms of discrimination against women, such as subordination, oppression, violence, and the like ( Megawangi, 2014). According to UNDP, the ideal concept of gender equality is quantitative equality (50:50), that men and women must have the same income, education and political participation, and if this can be achieved then the GDI and GEM figures obtained are 1, or in other words, there has been "*perfect equality*" ( Megawangi, 2014).

Inequality or gender inequality is also a form of treatment between women and men because of differences in gender roles between men and women. "Gender roles between men and women can be classified into three types: reproduction (domestic / family), production and roles in society" (Ministry of Women's & Children's Empowerment, 2016). Differences in roles between men and women result in five forms of gender injustice, namely: "stereotyping / labeling, subordination, marginalization, discrimination, and double burden " (Nugroho, 2011).

Equality of gender, refer to the "Equality of rights, responsibilities, opportunities, treatment, and assessment for men and women in employment, in the relationship between work and life" (Nelien & Busakorn, 2005)

Many people interpret the concept of gender equality is an equal condition, and there is no gap. However, in practice, the idea of justice (*egalitarianism*) is challenging to realize, because men and women are not the same, both capacity, pleasure, and needs. Precisely by "imposing the same, meaning we have done someone or some people unfairly" (Ratna Megawangi, 2014). The concept of a more grounded, namely equality of opportunity (*equality of opportunity*) to have the means to achieve a lot like powers, rights, education, and wealth. Therefore we need a program called " *means-regarding equality* " (D.Rae, 1981). This means that each individual (male and female), should be got means or tools together so that they can achieve equality by utilizing mathematically equal opportunities (50:50).

The concept of *means-regarding equalities*, apparently cannot be applied by allocating equal *lots*, because human capacities and abilities are not the same. "Diversity in humans both biologically, needs, skills, or preferences, inspired Tawney to create a concept of equality called " *person-regarding balance*, "which is not equality by giving equal treatment to every human being who has different needs, but instead giving the same attention to all humans so that the needs of each various individual can be met (Tawney, 1952). This means that men and women treated following the conditions, but both attention and honor the same. This concept is called "contextual equality" (Ratna Megawangi, 2014).

### **Job Promotion**

Job promotion is one of the activities of organizational management, in the context of developing human resources in an organization. For organizations, development has essential meaning, because " promotion means that organizational stability and employee morale will be more secure " ( Kadarisman, 2013). Promotion is an activity of moving employees from one position to another that has higher status and responsibilities. In general, sales followed by increased compensation (salary, etc.), although not always the case (B.Flippo, 1984). However, generally increased responsibility (Manullang, 2006). Not every sale implicated to increased earnings, because there are promotions resulted in an increase in compensation called a dry deal, (Samsudin, 2009). Although some think the development is not always implicated in the rise in *income*, in general, promotion is always followed by an increase in revenue with various other facilities ( Nitisemito, 1996). Advertisements are generally given as awards, prizes (*reward systems*) for their efforts, and participation in the past ( Rivai, 2006).

Promotions have value because it is evidence of the recognition of the organization's ability well as employee skills relevant to the higher positions. Promotion office will provide social status, authority (authority), responsibility (responsibility), and income (*outcomes*) were more significant for employees ( Hasibuan, 2008). The promotion will bring influence/motivation and increase the ability of employees to occupy higher positions (Gaouzali, 2000). With the advancement of view, more or less, the need for a sense of achievement ( *Sense of performance*) of an employee will be fulfilled. For this reason, organizations need to pay attention to the needs of employees through the preparation of appropriate and objective HR development programs. The principle is that promotion must be done transparently and objectively. Advertising is not solely intended as an employee needs only, will be, but the development will also bring benefits to the organization or a government agency to implement.

## Promotion Basics

Promoting employees is not merely to meet the needs or desires of employees, but must also be associated with the activities of the organization as a whole. Promotion must be based on objective considerations because the objectivity of a person's advertising will bring a positive impact on the growth of motivation or enthusiasm for other members of the organization (Martoyo, 2000).

Measuring promotional objectivity is not as easy as one might expect. Therefore "There are two bases for getting a promotion, namely work skills (*merit*) and seniority " (Samsudin, 2009).

In general, organizations consider someone to be promoted by using the basis of consideration of work performance and seniority (Siagian, 2008). Promotion with work performance applies the results of an assessment of the excellent work in the current position. Thus the development of the awards will but can also be used other considerations, such as calculation of the potential ability of the employee to sit in a higher position. At the same time, promotion based on seniority means that the most entitled to be promoted employees who have the most extended term of service.

Most organizations use the basis of employee seniority for promotion because "senior employees are more experienced, high loyalty, more honest. Besides, that promotion based on seniority is easiest, objective & transparent " (Gaouzali, 2000). On the other hand, priority has many disadvantages, including: " senior employees are sometimes static and lackluster; many experiences do not necessarily have high achievements; challenging to accept changes in materials and new developments; challenging to adjust to new technological developments. " ( Kadarisman, 2013) .

Noting the essential strengths and weaknesses of work performance and seniority, to meet the expectations of all employees, most organizations use a combination of work performance and seniority (Gaouzali, 2000; Dessler, 2005, Hasibuan, 2008).

Promotion of the position of a Civil Servant carried out following the provisions of Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning State Civil Apparatus, article 72 that " Promotion of Civil Servants is based on an objective comparison between competencies, qualifications, and requirements required by the position, an assessment of work performance, leadership, work the same, the creativity and consideration of the PNS performance assessment team at Government Agencies, regardless of gender, religion, race, and class. "

## Work performance

Work performance is often also interpreted as performance; in English, it is called *achievement*. Job performance is a result of work achieved by a person in carrying out the tasks assigned to him based on skill, experience, and affection as well as time (M. Hasibuan, 2000). Work performance is a combination of these factors. Put another higher factors above, the greater the work performance of the employee concerned. "Job performance is the result of quality and quantity of work achieved by an employee in carrying out his duties according to the responsibilities given to him" (Mangkunegara, 2000). A person who is said to achieve work is measured by the quality and quantity of work performed following the tasks and responsibilities given by the organization to him. "Performance is defined as the record of outcomes produced and specified job functions or activities during a specified period" (Bernardin, 1993).

According to Government Regulation Number 46 of 2011, "work performance is the work achieved by every civil servant in an organizational unit following the Employee Work

Objectives and Work Behavior" This means that the work performance of a civil servant is measured from the performance targets achieved following the Employee Work Target (SKP) and his work behavior. The work completed accomplished is assessed with instruments that are prepared according to the standards that have been made and determined by each agency or organization. With the assessment, it will be known whether the employee has done his job correctly. Performance appraisal is usually accompanied by *rewards* or rewards for employees who get functional assessments, but if the results of the evaluation indicate the opposite, then it is necessary to evaluate (Handoko, 2001; Kasmir, 2018; Mangkunegara, 2000).

The performance appraisal of a civil servant, as stipulated in PP 46 of 2011, which was revised by PP 30 of 2019 concerning Performance Evaluation of Civil Servants, was carried out systematically by the appraisal official on the work objectives of employees and civil servants' work behavior. Employee Performance Targets (SKP), according to the PP, "are performance plans and targets to be achieved by a civil servant that must be achieved every year." SKP measured by way of comparing the actual performance with the targets set. After the assessment results obtained SKP, in the Next will be combined with the results of appraisal work behavior was measured using performance measurement data. The accumulation of these two aspects (SKP and Work Behavior ), the performance value will be obtained.

### Seniority

The term seniority in the world of work naturally arises when a person is considered to have long carried out an assignment in an institution, has a rank and position higher than other employees. (S. Nitisemito, 1996; Wahyudi, 2002) . "Seniority, in addition to being used as a decision-making tool for promotional actions, is often also used as decision-making material to determine periodic salary increases (Manullang, 2012). Seniority is a way that is valid for the promotion, and seniority avoids subjectivity management that gives employees the first opportunity for the promotion favorites, but in terms of working time not long ago. Promotion based on priority will save time, is secure, and is the safest way because it does not cause pain when making promotional decisions (Simamora, 2005).

Seniority can be classified into several sections, including seniors in terms of age, authority, and years of service. Someone who has a long duration of service at an agency will get a senior nickname. Although there is a higher position, it would be. Still, if she had entered joined into an agency, it usually will remain cheekily against long-serving employees, although in her lower positions. From some of the expert opinions above, it can be drawn to the conclusion that seniority is the length of time a person works in an agency.

### METHODOLOGY

The phenomenon of gender equality that has not been realized in the promotion of structural positions P NS is a social problem. Social aspects can only be expressed internally with a qualitative approach. Researchers go directly to the study site for downloading in-depth information, examine the object of research studies, held a direct interaction with the informant to guide the theory raised by Siagian (2008), the provisions in the Law No. 5 of 2014 About ASN, as the normative rules that applies in the promotion of the position of a civil servant, as well as the theory of gender equality by Tawney (1952).

Information gathering from *key informants* is done by "*purposive sampling*," namely " sampling technique used by researchers if researchers have specific considerations in sampling" (Arikunto, 2000). As an informant of his was: Regional Head (Governor), the Regional Secretary, the Head of BKD West Java Provincial Government, Head of Career

Development BKD, Member of Parliament V Commission of West Java Province and Academics/gender experts and community leaders / cultural/religious. Whereas the *snowball sampling technique* was used for informants from the head of the SKPD, women structural officials from every level of position/echelon, executors/staff, and the families of women officials.

The primary tool or instrument for data collection in this research is the researcher himself (Sugiyono, 2010), using in-depth interviews and documentation studies as data collection techniques. The validity of research data is an important thing to know whether the data presented is valid or not. " To find out the validity of the data, the validity of the data technique is needed " (Sugiyono, 2010). In this study, researchers used two kinds of recirculation techniques to check the validity of the data, namely: methodological triangulation and source triangulation.

Research data analysis using an interactive model by Miles and Huberman in the form of data reduction and data presentation regard to the data collected and then do the pens offered are the conclusions and verification (Miles, MB, 1992).

## DISCUSSION

### Causes of Gender Equality in Promotion of Structural Position Not Yet Optimal in West Java Provincial Government

#### Work performance

The promotion of positions in government agencies both at central and regional levels is part of the career development of civil servants. According to article 72 of the ASN Law, work performance is one of the assessment indicators for the promotion of position, where the assessment of civil servant work performance is regulated in a separate provision, namely PP 46 of 2011 concerning the Evaluation of Civil Servant Work Achievement which is revised with PP 30 of 2019 on Civil Service Performance Evaluation. Performance appraisal of civil servants is based on performance planning at the individual and unit or organization level by taking into account the targets, achievements, results, and benefits achieved as well as the behavior of civil servants. As a follow up of Government Regulation 11 of 2017, the Provincial Government of West Java has issued Governor Regulation Number 58 of 2018 concerning the Management of Civil Servants Career Management in the Local Government of West Java Province. Thus, it is clear that both normative and promotion theory proposed by Siagian (2008), work performance is one of the indicators used as a basis for consideration for the promotion of a civil servant position both male and female, using two indicators namely the Employee Performance Target (SKP assessment) and PNS Behavior.

Based on research, SKP assessment cannot be used as a basis for measuring the level of work performance of a civil servant in the West Java Provincial Government, because the data validation is still very weak. SKP assessment results show that 98% of civil servants get a superior rating (above expectations), whereas if assessed objectively, according to PP 30/2019, PNS distribution will get the highest performance appraisal rating of 20% at the status of performance above expectations, at most the lowest is 60%. The most top 70 % is in the condition according to expectations, and the highest is 20% in status below expectations. Because the SKP results have not yet demonstrated the objectivity of actual employee performance, in the process of screening civil servants who will be promoted, do not use these SKP performance indicators as the basis for their consideration. That is, SKP can not be

expected to female civil servants in the West Java provincial government bureaucracy to gain promotion. This also has an impact on the difficulty of increasing the number of female civil servants holding high Pratama leadership positions, because SKP is not used as an indicator of the promotion evaluation of supervisory officers (echelon IV) and administrators (echelon III ). In contrast, when seen from the data of female structural officials, 80% occupy a supervisory position (echelon IV), 18% hold the administrator's position (echelon III), and only 2% hold great Pratama leadership (echelon II level). This means that opportunities for women who are in the supervisory and administrator positions for promotion are small.

SKP is not used as a consideration in the promotion of position, certainly very unfortunate, considering the performance appraisal is a tool for organizations (leaders) to evaluate the performance results of individual employees following the process determined by each organization (Kasmir, 2018; Andrew 2000). Besides that, it is also to assess the effects of real work with the quality and quantity standards of employees (SPM Hasibuan, 2008).

The second indicator to assess work performance is work behavior. M according to PP No. 30, the Year 2019 Article 1 (7) work behavior can be seen from the " attitudes, practices and actions of civil servants or otherwise do not do something according to applicable regulations. " The work behavior assessment is based on the evaluation of the PNS Performance Appraisal Officer, peer-level, and direct subordinates. The instrument used to measure work behavior is called the *Peer Review 360<sup>o</sup>*. There are six aspects assessed: service orientation, work initiative, commitment, discipline, cooperation, and leadership. The *Peer Review 360<sup>o</sup>* was only implemented during the administration of Governor Ridwan Kamil, precisely in November 2018. The *Peer Review 360<sup>o</sup>* was conducted in private, civil servants. Those judged do not know who their peers and subordinates are judging their behavior. Thus the appraiser will be more free and honest to assess without any hesitation (for colleagues of the same level) or worry (for subordinates). For those who are determined, this system will make the control tool for civil servants always to maintain "honesty, discipline, loyalty, cooperation, communication and work performance, which are all requirements for an employee for promotion" (SPM Hasibuan, 2008).

Results *Peer Review 360<sup>o</sup>* used as consideration for promotion of structural and by Regional Secretary of West Java province, *Peer Review 360<sup>o</sup>* is an indicator of a reasonably objective in judging a person to be promoted, especially for female civil servants who during this positioned on the second class set ah men in achieving career, because of the stereotype formed that the public sphere is the area of men's work. Objectivity in promotion is essential because it will "bring a positive impact on the growth of motivation and enthusiasm for other members of the organization" (Samsudin, 2009).

Meanwhile, according to Governor Ridwan Kamil, *Peer Review 360<sup>o</sup>*, is one form of efforts to carry out bureaucratic reform in the field of staffing in the West Java Provincial Government. Aside from that, Ridwan Kamil also targets 40% of structural position positions to be filled by women during his leadership. As a tangible manifestation, Ridwan Kamil has appointed the Head of the Education Office of a woman, who won the highest *Peer Review 3 60<sup>o</sup>* rating. Decisions taken by Ridwan Kamil need to be appreciated and to be an example for the leaders of the other, especially the leadership ranks at the bottom, to improve the quality of personnel resources, especially women. This is important because "the strength of government organizations lies in a group of people who are prepared to realize the common goals and objectives" (Wilson Woodrow, 1903).

The decision to appoint the Head of the Education Office for women (Dr. Dewi Sartika) from the results of the 360<sup>o</sup> *Peer Review* and *assessment* showed recognition from

leaders, colleagues, and subordinates that women had the capacity and capability to occupy strategic positions, not because of subjectivity. So far, past obstacles are one of the challenges for women to develop their careers, because "there are only a few women recorded in history and this is used as a justification for women's inability to act like men" ( Ibrahim in Partini, 2013).

Although *Peer Review 360°* by the Government of West Java Province instrument considered the *fairest* to judge a person's behavior and ability to cooperate, civil servants, not all public servants have the votes together. Some civil servants believe the *Peer Review 360°* to have still weaknesses, among which there is no *feedback* for civil servants who are deemed to know what their weaknesses are in the eyes of others and on that basis they are expected to be able to improve their shortcomings or weaknesses so that in subsequent assessments these deficiencies no longer exist or are not are in the red zone.

Instruments *Peer Review 360°* equipped with a standard not yet clear value to every aspect rated, so the assessment is highly dependent on the perception of each assessor. This is what makes *Peer Review's* subjectivity high because it depends on *likes and dislikes*. Furthermore, the provisions of the number of weight ratings of *peer review* used for promotion has not been set explicitly. However, Secretary West Java Provincial Government declared 30%, at a level below this figure has not been socialized, it is drawn from a variety of responses from the informant to the weights This *peer review* assessment, and the weighting has not been listed in the Governor Regulation No. 58 of 2018 which is used as a legal basis for the promotion of civil servant positions in the West Java Provincial Government.

For women civil servants who are considered this can be detrimental if the judges are people who are firmly embedded in patriarchal values in themselves that the leader must be a man and do not want to be led by a woman, because he considers women as someone who has much weakness with all her feminine image (gentle, emotionally prioritized than logic, dependent, etc.), so it is not suitable to occupy leadership positions. "The dichotomy between men and women is an obstacle for women to get an objective assessment" ( Ibrahim, in Partini, 2013).

The results of the study show that the use of *Peer Review* as an indicator for the promotion of positions has not been able to increase the percentage of women who hold places, especially high-ranking Pratama positions. This can be seen from the comparison of the number of men and women who hold echelon III and II posts are still quite gapped. Female officers in echelon III are only 2,5 % and echelon II only 10% of the total number of officials in echelon III and II, both men and women. This means that the *360° Peer Review* assessment cannot be expected to increase the percentage of women getting promotion positions.

## Seniority

Since the birth of Law No. 5 of 2014 concerning State Civil Apparatus, " ASN Management is carried out based on a merit system, which is based on qualifications, competencies, and performance justly and fairly. For promotions, according to the provisions of Law No. 5 of 2014, article 72 does not mention seniority or rank order (DUK) as a basis for the promotion of positions as applicable under the foregoing statutory provisions, namely Law Number 43 of 1999.

Governor Law Number 58 of 2018, regulates civil servants can be promoted if it meets the minimum standards of several requirements, including a minimum of 2 years occupying a position below it and has reached the minimum rank in echelon to be held. In contrast, the

age limit is not set for a particular age for a job. This means that as long as the relevant civil servant is considered to be still in the active civil servant age and has not yet entered retirement age, then he still has the right to promotion.

From the legal aspect, it is clear that for now, seniority is no longer the basis for consideration for promotion. However, this does not mean that seniority is completely ignored, because in practice, sometimes policymakers still consider this aspect of rank, but it is not the primary consideration.

As a result of research on the seniority dimension, it is known that seniority is no longer used as a basis for consideration in the promotion of positions, including female civil servants. Since the enactment of Law No.5 Year 2014, career development through promotion has been carried out using the merit system approach (competence, qualifications, and performance). However, in practice in the field, several informants, both officials in charge of career development and female officials, stated seniority in work experience or position was still a consideration, although not the main one. Thus from the aspect of priority, it cannot increase the percentage of women to be promoted to occupy structural positions, so the expected gender equality is still challenging to realize.

### **Competence**

Each type of work requires a series of requirements and competencies so that the implementation can run effectively and efficiently. Therefore, every person who will carry out the work must be adjusted to the ability of skills needed. In other words, employees who are given the task of doing a job or position must have competence in the field of work regardless of gender, male or female. Ability is one of the primary considerations for promotion following Law No. 5 of 2014 Article 72.

The competencies that must be possessed by a civil servant to be able to occupy a position according to PP No. 11 of 2017 and Pergub 58 of 2018, in the form of technical competence, managerial competence, socio-cultural competence, and governance. As a follow up to the Governor's Regulation, West Java Governor Decree No. 821.29 / KEP-441-Org / 2018 Concerning Position Competency Standards for Primary Officials and Administrators in the West Java Provincial Government Environment. This competency must be proven by certificates, including certificates of Leadership Training, Training of Goods and Services, and other technical training.

The level of competence of women civil servants in West Java Provincial Government can only be photographed from a comparison of data on the number of women who occupy structural positions with Leadership Training alumni, bearing in mind that other Training Data is not obtained because it is not well documented.

Based on the alumni database, either the Pim Training II period 2014 - 2017, occurs fairly sharp inequality between men and women. Pim II Education and Training alumni were nine people (90%) and one woman (10%). Whereas the requirement for promotion to the position of Primary High Leadership (echelon II) according to the provisions in article 33 (k) of Governor Law 58 in 2018, is preferred who has a Pim II Education and Training certificate. However, for the time being, there is wisdom, can be placed in the office first, after that only included in the PIM Training. This is because the quota available for training is limited in number, and the time for conducting training is not always ahead of the promotion. This means that according to the provisions of the gubernatorial regulation No. 58 the Year 2018, female civil servants who meet the competency requirements of managerial / leadership to compete for promotion to the higher leadership positions and leadership Pratama upper-

middle only about 0, 1 % alone and this number is very small even though the echelon II position is strategic as a policymaker, *top leader* and *top manager* in a Regional Apparatus Organization and the Bureau.

In the 2014-2018 Pim III Training, there was also a significant gap where the number of Pim III Training alumni from male civil servants was 79 people (74%) and 28 female employees (26%). From the Pim IV Diklat alumni data, it can be seen that the number of male PNS alumni is 144 people (72%), while the female civil servants are 55 people (28%). The gap between the number of men and women in the Pim IV Training Program is still high; female alumni are only about a third of men. In contrast, according to the provisions of article 31 of Governor Regulation 58 of 2018, to be able to occupy echelon IV positions, it is preferred for employees who already have a Certificate of Education and Training Pim IV. If accumulated, the total for all civil servants who have been following Pim Training II, III, and IV in the period 2014-2018 according to data from the provincial government BPSDM many as 315 people, consisting of 232 people male (74 %) and 84 women (26 %).

The low number of female civil servants participating in Pim Training, indeed cannot be separated from the rectification process that does not pay attention to the allocation and balance between male and female academics, but based on: first, the database of structural officials who are already sitting in positions, but have not yet participated in Pim Training Second, based on the latest fundamental official inauguration data, to see who are newly appointed officials who have not however taken office in Pim Training. If the recruitment process of Diklat participants continues to use this mechanism, then certainly there will never be an increase in the number of female Diklat participants, and the competence of female PNS will continue to be below that of male PNS. It is, therefore, necessary competence development for female civil servants, to provide and certainty career, balancing career development with organizational needs, improve the competence and performance and builds up t kan professionalism of civil servants working women.

### Qualification

In addition to competence, the basis for the consideration of promotion of position according to Law No. 5 of 2014 (article 72) is the qualification, which is a skill required by a civil servant to do a job or position. Requirements can be obtained by attending formal education from the lowest (elementary) to the highest (S3). The provisions of this formal education qualification are listed in PP No. 11 of 2017, and the West Java Provincial Government follows up on this PP with Regulation 58 of 2018.

According to the Head of Career Development Board of West Java Provincial Government BKD, one of the causes of the low number of female civil servants who occupy structural positions, because in terms of qualifications female civil servants are more economical than male civil servants, especially in S2 and S3 education levels, a description of the level of education can be seen in the table following:

**Table 2**  
**Civil Servants of West Java Province Based on Education**  
**2019**

NO	Last education	Lk	Percentage (%)	Pr	Percentage (%)	Total
1	Primary school	350	90.90	35	9.09	385
2	JSS	545	93.47	22	1.76	567

3	SLTA	2,960	79.37	1,407	32.22	4,367
4	Diploma I	89	89	11	11	100
5	Diploma II	325	67.71	155	32.29	480
6	Diploma III	1,079	52.53	975	47.47	2054
7	Diploma IV	181	70.42	76	29.57	257
6	Bachelor	12,206	48.86	12,774	51.14	24,980
7	Master	2,434	60.23	1,607	39.77	4,041
8	Doctor	80	79.19	25	23.80	105
	<b>amount</b>	<b>20,248</b>		<b>17888</b>		<b>37,336</b>

Source: West Java Provincial BKD, Oct 2019

According to the provisions in PP No. 11 of 2017 and West Java Governor Regulation No.58 of 2018, for promotion of supervisory positions preferably have a formal education diploma level Diploma IV / Strata 1, for the position of Administrator preferred employees who have a diploma level education level, for promotion to the area of Primary High Leaders preferably have Post-graduate / Strata 2 formal education diplomas and subsequently for Middle-Senior Leadership positions, are required to have legal education competency at Doctoral / Strata 3 level.

Using data on the level of civil servant education in West Java Provincial Government above, as well as the minimum educational needs for promotion of echelon IV positions it is known that the number of civil servants at Diploma IV level is 257 people with a composition: 181 men (70.42%) and 76 people (29.57 %) female. The gap between the level of education of civil servants of men with women adrift far enough. At the undergraduate degree, the number of male civil servants was 12,206 (48.86%), and women were 12,774 (51.14%). At the Strata 1 level of education, it is illustrated that the level of knowledge of female civil servants is slightly higher than that of men. As for the Post Graduate level (S2), the level of education of civil servants male of 2434 (60.23%) and women was 1,607 (39.77%). At the S2 level, the formal education level of male PNS is higher than that of female PNS. A very significant gap can be seen from the level of Doctoral / S3 education, where there are 80 men (79, 19 %) and 25 women (23.81%).

If seen as a whole level of education, indeed, the formal education qualifications of female PNS can be said to be lower than the education level of male PNS. This positively greatly influences the assessment of job promotion, bearing in mind that the requirements for formal education at every echelon level have been stipulated in Pergub Number 58 of 2018. With more male civil servants, especially at the diploma, undergraduate, master, and doctoral degrees, the opportunity to occupy structural positions are certainly more open for male civil servants than women.

Efforts to improve civil servant qualifications have been carried out by sending study assignments and granting study permits for civil servants every year with a Governor Decree. For 2019 has been published West Java Governor Decree 890 / Kep 524-BKD / 2019 About Formation Continuing Education and Research in the Environment Provincial Government PNS West Java. In 2019 the formation of learning assignments was 37 people with the composition of the Masters level (S2) as many as seven people, Diploma 4 as many as six and Diploma 3 as many as six people. Of the 37 learning task formations, the most significant percentage are in the Government Management Accounting Study Program (24 establishments) for Diploma 4. Furthermore, for study permits, the Government of West Java

Province prepares quite a lot of formations for employees who want to improve their education, starting at diploma level 3 to a doctoral degree (S3). Study permit formations have been established according to the needs of each Regional Apparatus Organization, with Study Programs related to the needs of each OPD. For 2019 there are 2490 study permit formations spread across 38 DPOs.

The West Java Provincial Government has given the opportunity to improve qualifications by issuing a study assignment policy and study permit each year without limiting the sexes of men and women. Still, female civil servants have not maximally taken the opportunity, due to various obstacles encountered, including multiple roles, cultural values adopted "giving in" put husband and economy first. This dual role is often an obstacle for women to have a career (Partini, 2013). The attitude of giving in or accepting the situation is a socio-cultural obstacle faced by women.

Most informants with the status of young mothers aged between 25-35 years stated difficulties in dividing time between work and household affairs. Whereas the group of female civil servants above 40 years of age generally said they could no longer absorb lessons, and prioritized the cost of education for their children or husbands. "Hormonally different men and women, and these hormonal differences affect the behavior and nature of men and women." (Kimura, 1992) Differences in natural (*nature*) are *de facto* this, universally applicable, and often found elsewhere. Therefore, we encounter many cases of a woman whose status as a mother has no ambition to pursue a career and is even willing to stop working also though she has the ability and excellent career opportunities for her children. The stance taken, showing evidence that biology/nature / natural (*nature*) that makes women willing to give up a career or reduce it. Inevitably the inner bond between mother and child is powerfully interwoven because Mother naturally, the mother is pregnant, giving birth and breastfeeding her children.

In terms of educational qualifications, female civil servants in the bureaucracy of the West Java Provincial Government are still below male civil servants. This is one of the causes of the low number of women who occupy structural positions, especially those that are strategic in the West Java Provincial Government. Though the level of education is one of the requirements to get a promotion. The low level of women's school does not only occur in the West Java Provincial Government but also is a factor causing the little involvement of women in politics. The education of women legislators is still small compared to male legislators. (Nurdin, Nurliah 2003) This ultimately led to gender equality, not being realized optimally.

### **Other Aspects That Are Considered as Promoting the Position of Female Civil Servants in the Government of West Java Province**

It has been explained in the previous section that competency, qualifications and work performance ( Peer Review ) are the basis for the consideration of promotion in the Provincial Government of West Java, and it turns out that from the assessment of these three indicators female civil servants are still lower than men. The low competency, qualifications, and work performance of women are caused by various obstacles faced by women, both internal and external.

In addition to the three indicators mentioned above, it turns out that other aspects are considered by the PNS Performance Assessment Team when promoting female PNS in a position, namely the consideration of the multiple roles that must be undertaken by female PNS. When the location of a job is far or outside the city, and working hours require 24-hour readiness, it is not recommended that the position be held for women, because it is feared that

if caught by women, the performance will not be optimal. It would be better if women were looking for volunteer jobs or jobs that did not cause much conflict with their role as caregivers for their children. ( Parson in Ratna Megawangi, 2014) . Perception internally has more significant influence for female civil servants to be promoted, placing women in a dilemma because they lived a dual role. (Sedarmayanti & Gusti Nella Resna Dakhi, 2017)

Besides the multiple functions, the type of work or task is also a consideration. Jobs considered high risk, more fieldwork than administration, requiring physical strength or male (masculine) types of work are also not recommended for women. However, if it is considered that the woman civil servant is capable, then before promotion, there are times when asking the nominated female civil servant about her ability and the approval of her husband or family when occupying the position.

The *stereotype of the type of work* is masculine and feminine because the dominant organizational culture is patrilineal and influenced by patriarchal cultural values that are still strongly believed and carried out by the people of West Java. The assumption that women certainly will not be optimal in carrying out masculine-type tasks has shown that there is a belief or value in an organization that has been embedded deep enough to make it difficult to change. This value or belief is the second layer of organizational culture (Edgar, 2004). *N* use values-the amount of corporate culture can also be a driving force and an impediment to the promotion of women. In this study, the authors found that the organizational culture of the West Java Provincial Government became one of the causes of women's areas for promotion of positions becoming narrower, and it was only natural that eventually structural positions would be dominated by men. It reinforces previous research by Nurliah Nurdin (2003) that the retention of culture proved to be one of the factors that influence the representation of women not only in the legislature, will but also in the executive.

The domination of men occupying positions indirectly justifies that the work or tasks of the government bureaucracy are masculine (male) type. However, not entirely that the masculine solely owned by men only, in fact, women also have the masculine traits in addition to the feminine, and the main tasks as the State Civil Apparatus is providing services and women have a *sense of Servicer* better than man As a public servant, it requires patience, gentleness, perseverance, responsiveness to normative changes and submission to superiors. These characteristics are generally more widely owned by women than men. If both properties (mas k ironwood and feminine), chime inside a woman, it would make a woman will be the perfect figure to serve as a leader, because in him will sound in nature: bold, aggressive, strong, gentle and patient.

## CONCLUSION

Job promotion is a form of recognition of an employee's work performance followed by an increase in authority, duties, responsibilities, income, and various facilities. Therefore, promotion is a desire of all employees, both men, and women. In legal jurisdiction, there is no discrimination for women to get publicity in the West Java Provincial Government. Still, in reality, there is a significant gap, from 1685 structural positions, female civil servants only occupy 519 (31%) positions, while male civil servants 1166 (69%) positions. The results of the study concluded that gender equality in the promotion of structural areas in West Java Province had not been realized optimally because the competencies, qualifications, and work behavior of female civil servants are considered lower than men. Various obstacles faced by female civil servants for the promotion of both internal factors, namely the dual role and lack of motivation of women to progress, as well as impediments to external factors stemming

from the family environment, community, and organizational culture that has not been gender-responsive. In addition to competence, qualifications, and work behavior, other considerations were found for the promotion of the position of a female civil servant, namely: multiple roles, type of work and location of assignments; this made women less likely to get strategic position promotions.

## REFERENCE

1. (LAN), L. A. N. (2016). Press Release: PUG Mendorong Aparatur Negara yang Kompeten dan Profesional.
2. Anak, K. P. P. dan P. (2016). *Pembangunan Manusia Berbasis Gender 2016*. CV. Lintas Katulistiwa.
3. Arikunto, S. (2000). *Prosedur Penelitian; Suatu Pendekatan Praktek Edisi ke -3*. Jakarta: Rineke Cipta.
4. B.Flippo, E. (1984). *Personel management (Terjemahan)*. (A. Sirait, Ed.) (6th ed.). Jakarta: Erlangga.
5. Bernardin, R. (1993). *Human Resource Management*. New Jersey : International Editions Upper Saddle River, Prentice-Hall.
6. D.Rae. (1981). *Equalities*. Cambridge,MA: Harvard University Press.
7. Dessler, G. (2005). *Human Resource Management (10th ed.)*. Pearson/Prentice Hall.
8. Edgar, H. S. (2004). *Organizational Culture and Leadership (3rd ed.)*. San Francisco: ossey-Bass A Wiley Imprint.
9. Gaouzali, S. (2000). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia (Suatu Pendekatan Mikro)*. Jakarta: Djambatan.
10. Handoko. (2001). *Manajemen Personalia dan Sumber Daya Manusia*. Yogyakarta: BPFH.
11. Hasibuan, M. (2000). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia, edisi revisi (revisi)*. Jakarta: PT Bumi Aksara.
12. Hasibuan, S. P. M. (2008). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: PT Bumi Aksara.
13. Indah Lukita sari, Anugrah Pambudi Raharjo, & Dina Nur Rahmawati'. (2018). *Pembangunan Manusia Berbasis Gender 2018*. Jakarta.
14. Kasmir. (2018). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia (Teori dan Praktik) (4th ed.)*. Depok: PT RajaGrafindo Persada.
15. Kimura. (1992). *Sex Differences in The Brain*.
16. M.Kadarisman. (2013). *Manajemen Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia (2nd ed.)*. Jakarta: PT. RajaGrafindo Persada.
17. Mangkunegara, A. P. (2000). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Perusahaan*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosda Karya.
18. Manullang. (2006). *Manajemen Personalia*. Jakarta: Gadjah Mada Press.
19. Manullang. (2012). *Dasar-Dasar Manajemen Bagi Pimpinan Perusahaan*. Gajah Mada Press.
20. Martoyo, S. (2000). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Yogyakarta: Rineka Cipta.
21. Miles , M.B., A. M. H. (1992). *Qualitative Data Analysis (2nd ed.)*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
22. Nelien, H., & Busakorn, S. (2005). *Meningkatkan Kesetaraan Gender dalam Aksi Penanggulangan Pekerja Anak serta Perdagangan Perempuan dan Anak*. Retrieved from [www.ilo.org/publns](http://www.ilo.org/publns)
23. Nugroho, R. (2011). *Gender dan Strategi Pengarus- Utamanya di Indonesia*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
24. Nurdin, N. (2003). *The Representation of Women's interests in Comparative Perspective with Focus on Indonesia*. Northern Illinois University The United State of America.
25. Parawansa, K. I. (2002). *Hambatan Terhadap Partisipasi Politik Perempuan di Indonesia*. International IDEA.
26. Partini. (2013). *Bias Gender dalam Birokrasi (2nd ed.)*. Yogyakarta: Tiara Wacana.
27. Ratna Megawangi. (2014). *Membiarkan Berbeda Edisi Revisi Sudut Pandang Baru tentang*

- Relasi Gender*. (F. Y. J. Santi Nolita, Ed.). Depok: Indonesia Heritage Foundation.
28. S.Nitisemito, A. (1996). *Manajemen Personalialia, Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Gholia Indonesia.
  29. Samsudin, S. (2009). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Bandung: Pustaka setia.
  30. Saxonberg, S. (2009). Freedom of Choice through the Promotion of Gender Equality, 666–680. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9515.2009.00687.x>
  31. Sedarmayanti, & Gusti Nella Resna Dakhi. (2017). Persepsi Mengenai Promosi Jabatan Struktural PNS Perempuan di Pemerintah Kota Gunungsitoli. *Ilmu Administrasi, XIV*, 167–184.
  32. Siagian, S. P. (2008). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia (edisi pertama)*. Jakarta: Bina Putra Aksara.
  33. Simamora, B. (2005). *Analisis Multivariat Pemasaran*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
  34. Sugiyono. (2010). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif Kualitatif dan R&D* (10th ed.). Bandung: Alfabeta.
  35. Tawney, R. . (1952). *Equality* (4th ed.). London: Allen and Unwin.
  36. Veithzal Rivai. (2006). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Perusahaan* (1st ed.). Jakarta: PT RajaGrafindo Persada.
  37. Wahyudi. (2002). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Sulita.
  38. Welch, J., & Welch, S. (2005). *Winning*. Harper Business.
  39. Wilson Woodrow. (1903). *The State*.
  40. Wwww.kpu.go.id, : (n.d.). Jumlah Anggota DPR RI Menurut Jenis Kelamin, 1955-2014.
  41. [Tribunnews.com](http://www.tribunnews.com) dengan judul Hanya 31 Perempuan Terpilih Sebagai Kepala Daerah, <http://www.tribunnews.com/nasional/2018/08/01/hanya-31-perempuan-terpilih-sebagai-kepala-daerah>. (diunduh 22 maret 2019) Penulis: Glery Lazuardi , Editor: Johnson Simanjuntak