The Outlook of Akhism to the Economic Life and Its Comparison with Capitalist System

Metin Ozdemir
Centre of Economic Sharia Ankara, Turkey
Email: metin.ozd22@yahoo.com

Abstract

The fact that human beings, the exceptional beings of the world, can maintain their vitality in trust and prosperity is depended on its success in production to meet its own needs, which is largely expressed as economics, and its justice-based behavior in consumption and sharing. In this sense, it is clearly not possible to realize the welfare and happiness of the world with the capitalistic system containing Neo-Liberal politics, which takes the sole purpose of capital accumulation by maximizing profits without any ethical anxiety. However, this capitalistic system is still being implemented as an economic system without an alternative in the majority of the World. On the other hand, in the Akhism whose the basic principles are the Islamic values, it is possible to see that much more reasonable principles are adopted both in the name of general welfare and peace of mankind, and also in the sense of sensitivity to the environment. In this work, both systems will be compared in order to promote the foundation of world peace and the general prosperity of humanity.

Keywords: Akhism, Capitalism, Liberalism.

A. INTRODUCTION

For this world we live in, the main purpose of man is within the framework of his values. It is certain that he can lead a life in trust, peace and prosperity. There is no doubt that economic activities have an important place in sustaining such a lifestyle. Because it is possible for a person to survive with the values he possesses both physically and spiritually to the extent that they can produce with their labor. In reality, there is nothing more than sweat for a person. In addition, human beings, who have the chance to be an equal creature with their mind and intelligence, gain value in proportion to the values they possess by using these abilities correctly.

In this sense, it is not possible to consider the economic lives and systems of nations apart from their values. It is seen that in both the capitalist economic approach and socialist economic philosophy deriving from the egalitarian discourse, which the imperialist West derives and imposes on the world with positive concepts such as free competition and economic freedom, instead of sharing the wealth, which is essentially the product of labor, the main purpose is to accumulate in the hands of the powerful.

Even if both economic systems are presented as alternatives to each other, it is not possible for the thought put forward to be different, since they are fed by the same values. Because while the capitalist system foresee the accumulation of capital in the individual in a libertarian environment that always favors the powerful, the socialist system foresees the concentration of all wealth in the state apparatus with a controlling structure.
However, the Ahi Organization, which aims to establish a world order and is a good example of the successful application of the culture produced by the Islamic belief in practical life, primarily aimed at a good human model and a perfect society that will consist of it. The model person targeted by this distinguished thought; It is possible to define them as individuals who are in harmony with the society they live in and are aware of their responsibilities towards them, equipped with religious and secular sciences, who do not have the slightest weakness in moral matters, who are constantly productive with an active understanding of life.

However, the Ahi Organization, which aims to establish a world order and is a good example of the successful application of the culture produced by the Islamic belief in practical life, primarily aimed at a good human model and a perfect society that will consist of it. The model person targeted by this distinguished thought; It is possible to define them as individuals who are in harmony with the society they live in and are aware of their responsibilities towards them, equipped with religious and secular sciences, who do not have the slightest weakness in moral matters, who are constantly productive with an active understanding of life.

It is possible to list the personal moral qualities that an ahis should never possess and that otherwise cause them to be expelled from the ahi as follows: Drinking alcohol, committing adultery, hypocrisy, gossip, slander, pride, ruthlessness, jealousy, grudge, not keeping promises, lying, betraying trust, not covering someone else's shame, stinginess, indolence and killing people with such a social structure that forces even our dreams in the world we live in today. We can think that it constitutes a second Era of Bliss. The happiness, peace and well-being of the people who can only be beneficial to their environment in all matters including the economic life of the Ahi Organization, which is formed by such excellent people, is the main goal.

B. METHODOLOGY

Research was conducted using qualitative methods. With this qualitative method, researchers attempt to reveal the universal essence of phenomena personally experienced by a group of individuals in depth. Data was collected through several techniques, including observation techniques, focus group discussions, and documentation studies. Data analysis was carried out through three analysis processes, namely coding, merging codes that emerged into themes, verification of themes through theory and follow-up interviews, and drawing conclusions (Creswell, 2010).

C. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

1. Why Are We Talking About Course Today?

To be talking about the Ahi culture and organizational structure in our country today; It should not only be limited to understanding the historical past, or remembering what good deeds our ancestors did in the past and taking a share from it. Much more important than these, we live in today with the idea of "share from the
parable”; How can we benefit from the Ahilik culture while looking for a solution to the problems that are getting worse day by day in the economic, political, social, educational, cultural and military fields? We believe that this should be sought.

At this point, the capitalist economic system, which adopts the accumulation of capital as its main target and currently dominates the world, has “achieved much” for now. Because, according to the research conducted by the Oxfam Group, headquartered in England and operating as an aid organization; the wealth of the richest 1 percent in the world increased from 44 percent of the total wealth in 2009 to 48 percent in 2014. It is also a fact that this inhumane trend continues to get more severe with each passing day (Oxfam, 2016).

The Ottoman Empire, which was active in Anatolia from the 13th century to the 18th century, and the reign of the Ottoman Empire in all the Balkan and Middle Eastern lands; Ahi culture, which provides great support in terms of economy as well as social and military, contains the solution of many social and economic problems of today. Ahi system in the context of current issues; It foresees a social structure created by individuals, which is compatible with the society in which it lives and possesses a sense of responsibility, which turns the principle of “giving is superior to the hand that takes the hand” into a complete philosophy of life, thus making it a civilization to give and share, not to accumulate by taking or seizing it.

2. Economic Principles of Immunity

It is possible to state that the principles of the Ahi organization, which is based on the model of good people and citizens with social responsibility awareness, consist of business ethics that are bound to certain principles. Business ethics and economic thought in Ahi are based on an understanding that aims to integrate the producer with the product, as if to give the product something from its soul. In this context, economic purpose in the thought system of Ahilik; It can be summarized as protecting the producer and the consumer in a balanced way, not by producing more and making more, but by limiting the production amount and prices when necessary without giving up quality products (Şimşek, 2002: 180-181). A series of basic principles have been developed in order for the Ahi-order to achieve its aforementioned goals and these have been applied without any flexibility. Related principles; It is possible to summarize the system of compassion, avoidance of pretense, cooperation, internal audit and standardization.

Satisfaction, which is one of the indispensable principles of ahilik, strongly influenced the economic thinking of the society. Considering the negative effects of maximizing profits, which is the main purpose of capitalist economic thought that dominates the world today, it will be clear how important and urgent need of frugality is for humanity today. It is not possible for companies that continue their economic activities with the aim of raising profits to observe the rights of both their personnel and their commercial partners. In addition, a business whose sole target is profit and capital accumulation is unlikely to show the necessary sensitivity in terms of the depletion or pollution of environmental factors related to nature. At this point,
the obstinacy commanded by the Ahilik; It emerges as an indispensable feature in both considering the rights of other people and being much more sensitive to the environment.

Work ethics, even if not applied by everyone in relation to a profession, is a set of principles of behavior that are believed to be mentally correct and beneficial. Although moral principles are generally not written, they are tried to be applied by everyone because they are adopted by the society. Those who act contrary are punished by being pushed out of society by means of condemnation, reproach, being left alone, and not cooperating (Şahin, 1986: 110).

Today, when economically underdeveloped societies are examined, a serious erosion of the moral values and social dissolution together with insecurity in social relations are observed. The achievement of these societies to the points they deserve depends on their adoption of moral and ethical principles that will establish trust and a healthy relationship environment. These principles will naturally be composed of their own values.

It is possible to encounter this system, which is claimed to have emerged in Western Europe with industrialization, in the Ottoman society, which was dominated by the Ahilik Organization long before. Following Mehmet the Conqueror II. The Legislation İhtisab-ı Bursa, put into effect by Bayezid in 1502, is an important document in terms of being the first standards law in the world (Hamitoğulları, 1986: 126). In addition, the Izmir and Edirne Specialization (Municipality) laws prepared between 1502 and 1507 and containing more than 100 articles are accepted as the world’s first consumer protection law, the first environmental regulation and the first food regulation. These legislations cover the standards required by many professionals in production and service, from food and beverage manufacturers to jewelery, barbers, grocery stores and physicians. In today’s modern world, these standards are manufacturing standards (ISO9000), social responsibility standard (SA8000) and environmental management standards (ISO14000 series) etc. It is expressed in standards (Durak and Yücel, 2010: 165).

In the Ahi system, the tradesmen and craftsmen who produced similar goods or services operated in the same market, even if not under the same roof, similar to today’s large shopping mall system. Thanks to this system, it was possible for producers and tradesmen to control each other on price and quality of goods and to cooperate among themselves. This system enabled consumers to buy the best product in the shortest time by making comparisons between goods. In addition, it is known that Ahî Evran and his caliphs, Ahî leaders, visited the bazaars and controlled the goods from time to time (Erdem, 2008: 76).

In the Ahi Organization, if people who produce goods below the standards and cause harm to the consumer do not pay attention to these actions and continue these actions, they are punished with various penalties in proportion to the seriousness of their mistakes. These penalties range from the exposure of themselves and their products to the closure of their shops by the tradesman managers or
related institutions, and if they go further, sanctions ranging from tradesmen to dismissal may be imposed (Demir, 1993).

In the Ahi community, both personal moral education and vocational education have been realized in the plane of master-apprentice relationship. Thanks to this system, in addition to a quality education, the continuity of the system was ensured and also the auto control mechanism was operated. For example, if a master dismissed his apprentice because of his mistake, either the apprentice to forgive that master will return, or his former master must give permission before someone else can accept it. In addition, people who do not work as apprentices are not allowed to open a business or become a partner in any way because they have capital.

In this system, apprentices had to live in full devotion to their masters, professions and principles of the organization. In fact, this training of apprentices was not just a vocational training, but a wide range of responsibilities to his family and country as well as his behavior in society, his profession. Because the master-apprentice relationship; employee was based on a complete father-son relationship rather than employer (Ekinci, 1991).

The division of labor is another principle included in the Futures Document. This principle, while providing specialization in production on the one hand, was not welcomed due to the understanding that changing jobs frequently, on the other hand, is a practice that people with persistent and unstable moods would apply (Ekinci, 1989: 63). Ahis were able to produce only one good in their businesses.

This created an environment of equity besides specialization. However, today, large industrialists cause a great unfair competition by taking advantage of the goods produced by the peasants as well as their original production. This was not allowed in the Ahi community.

The idea of specialization, which came to the agenda for the first time in the West with the book "The Wealth of Nations" (1776) and which is one of the most basic principles of today’s modern economy, has been among the principles of the Ahi Organization in the past years and has been successfully applied for centuries. Work sharing; while enabling productivity increase by providing specialization, also tradesmen and He contributed to the functioning of the discipline and auto-control system among the craftsmen.

In the Ahi system, both the quality and quantity of the goods produced and the ability of individuals to open businesses were primarily controlled by the state, and when and where the state could not reach, by the tradesmen and craftsmen themselves. For example, in the Ottoman Empire, it was necessary for a foreman to prove his mastery in the presence of a committee in order to open a new workplace. “He was not allowed to open his workplace.

At the same time, the Ahi Babalar, who are in the position of the leader of the society, applied and enforced the Ahi-order rules determined according to the demands of the people as a law. Related topics; new business establishment, raw material supply and distribution, price, standard and production control, consumer complaints, education and trade manners, business ethics, product guarantee,
working principles, opening and closing a business, apprentice, foreman, mastery rules, borrowing and helping each other. Many issues and rules can be handled within this framework.

3. **Production in Ahilik**

The idea of Ahi-Order has approached the economic life mainly consisting of production, consumption and sharing. Because the guarantee of the power and existence of societies in this sense is not the consumption it realizes, but the production level. For this reason, the Ahili understanding, which recommends to be contented with less in an individual sense, does not accept being modest in any way in terms of quality and production, which is a necessity. As a result of the principle of “giving hand is superior to hand”, which is the basis of ahilik, it is the only way to work and produce in order to live a superior and strong life.

The necessity of working determination, sweat, that is, the importance of halal earnings, and the necessity of having a profession for the ahis are strongly recommended in the futures (Erdem, 2008: 65-68). There is no doubt that all these orders and suggestions will ultimately stimulate and increase production in the country. Although production, which is the main activity of economics, has an extremely important place in the thought of Ahili, it completely differs from the capitalist system in terms of what and how much will be produced.

In this framework, while working and production in the Ahi system is encouraged at every opportunity, what is produced, how and how much it is produced has been subject to continuous control. In the understanding of Ahilik, production is considered as a function of essential and halal needs, therefore, the production and trade of products and services that are more than necessary and not halal are strongly prohibited.

In today’s world, it is not acceptable to produce unnecessary, luxurious and even unhealthy goods and services for most societies and individuals with the artificial needs created by advertising just to maximize profits. There is no doubt that such an understanding is a method that threatens the waste of resources in the economy, environmental pollution and the future of the society and individual. In addition, with this understanding, it is not possible to ensure a sustainable development in the economy, and therefore a healthy continuity of life.

It is not an acceptable practice in the Ahi system for companies to shift their activities towards producing goods and services for the high-income segment of society in order to earn more money. Because in such an approach, instead of meeting the basic needs of the poor with low income, they prefer to satisfy the luxury and wasteful arbitrary desires of the rich, in other words, their passions for higher profit.

Therefore, the limited resources in nature for the profitability of firms are also wasted for the arbitrary desires of the rich rather than the indispensable needs of the poor. For this reason, avoiding waste and luxury in the field of consumption in the society will allow the basic needs of the wider poor to be met much more easily.
In Ahi-order, the purpose of production is not profit, but social benefit. In addition, the production of reasonable needs is still limited to certain limits. In this framework, in the understanding of Ahilik, it is not welcomed to make production for excessive demand arising in parallel with the stimulation of consumption, by accepting the unlimited needs and using the waste and resources unnecessarily (Öztürk, 2002).

Within this framework, production has been evaluated as a function of essential needs and it has been adopted not to produce more than necessary. Thus, the balance between producers and consumers was tried to be preserved.

Purpose in production of goods and services; Since the main purpose is to meet the needs of the society with the goods and services produced in the most appropriate way, the price of the products is determined according to the raw material and labor used and limited to a certain profit rate.

In addition, the direct sales method from the producer to the consumer has been preferred in order to ensure that the relevant products can reach the consumer in the cheapest way without intermediaries. For this purpose, separate markets have been created for each group of tradesmen who produce and market the goods. In these places, the consumers had the opportunity to make the right choice by finding many similar products directly from the manufacturer and by comparing them in terms of both quality and price (Demir, 2001).

While all these are being done, self-sufficiency has been accepted as an important principle in the society in order for the state to be economically independent and not to deal with external deficit and foreign debt. On the other hand, Ahi production unions have been encouraged to use the country's resources in full efficiency and to create a strong and independent country economy by giving priority to the production and consumption of domestic goods (Demir, 2009).

As it can be seen, while working and production in the Ahi community is highly recommended, it is aimed at the welfare of the state and the nation, not personal wealth. It is seen that the Ahilis attach special importance to the state's property and money in order not to be dependent on other states.

4. Consumption in Morality

Parallel to production, another indispensable activity of economic life is undoubtedly consumption. The idea of Ahi-order has brought certain principles on consumption as it is in production and organized the economic life as a whole within this framework.

In today's customer-oriented approach, there is a desire to make consumers consume more. However, in Ahi-order there is only consuming as much as needed and sharing the surplus with others (Durak and Yücel, 2010: 158).

It is not possible to express that the "one bite and one cardigan" approach, which is still spoken in our society today and which envisages a Muslim to lead a sluggish life by withdrawing from the world, is in no way compatible with the understanding of Ahilik. Because, as mentioned above, the Ahi system predicts an
active and productive life in the field of production, but recommends being extremely modest in consumption.

Therefore, it is possible to state that the understanding of "One bite, one cardigan" can be accepted not for work and production, but only for consumption. The thought of Ahi-order accepted consumption as a requirement of essential basic needs, and consumption, which avoids all kinds of showiness and waste, did not welcome it in any way. In this context, the Ahi understanding distinguishes between needs and passion, especially in consumption.

The need must be met in order for the individual and society to survive in a healthy and safe way; It consists of other basic needs specific to that age, such as food, drink, housing, education, health and safety. However, passion, especially for the individual's personal power and reputation in the society he / she lives in, all kinds of; wealth, accumulation and grandeur and show-based wishes and desires.

At this point, while the Ahi-order does not impose any restrictions on meeting the needs of the individual, it aims to control passion through obedience in the name of social peace, a balanced development and avoiding all kinds of waste.

5. Thought Of Economics Against The Capitalist System

According to the capitalist economic theory educated in our country today, the widely and widely accepted definition of economics is as follows: "Economics is a social science that aims to meet the unlimited needs of people at the highest level with scarce resources in nature." Despite the unlimited acceptance of the needs of people here, the fact that the natural resources to meet them are predicted as scarce makes a conflict in the world economy inevitable. The first step of this inevitable conflict is the constant increase of prices for profit maximization, which is the primary goal of the capitalist system.

We have to admit that the economic thought envisaged by the Ahi-order consists mainly of economic principles stemming from the Islamic belief. In Islamic belief; His orders about helping people, not eating right of servant, not accumulating excessive wealth, being beneficial to people and working / producing constituted the basis of the economic regulations in Ahilik thought.

Today, the only goal of individual and business activity in the world and unfortunately in our country is based on profitability and earning money. However, it is not discussed enough, sometimes not at all, how the work has benefited society, or even whether it causes harm. When the target is profitability; many immoral and illegal activities can become more attractive to many people. Especially in recent years, increasing in societies; theft, deception, snatching, fraud, bid rigging, corruption, rent seeking, drugs, trafficking in women and children, etc. It is not possible to explain the increase in many economically based ordinary crimes independent of the value judgment of "get rich or how you are" and the education provided accordingly.
It is expected that the primary expectation of people from the work they do is to generate benefits by meeting any legitimate needs of other people before earning money. With the economic activity carried out with this in mind, the person will be happy to the extent that he produces a good or service that will meet the essential needs of other people, while he will gain the peace of earning the income he needs in a legitimate way. Therefore, social value judgments based on wealth should be transformed into being beneficial to people and producing.

In this context, despite the thought that Economics in the capitalist system has no morality, it is stipulated that economic activities must be strictly dependent on moral values in the Ahi culture, and the production and trade of products and services that may harm people through illegal and immoral means is prohibited.

At this point, the understanding that has become a tool for the purpose of earning money in economic activities in our country and in the world will be reversed, the aim will be to produce a useful work for humanity, and then to gain a healthier society structure.

The purpose of production must be to employ more people in this process and to benefit from the resulting goods and services, rather than ensuring the monopolization of capital by maximizing profit. For example; One of the projects to be established with the same capital and facilities; Let it be 5% profitable and provide employment for 100 people, while the other is 20% profitable and provides employment for 25 people. Suppose the first of these is a human-oriented investment, while the other is a profit-oriented investment.

While the capitalist system prefers the second of these projects for capital accumulation, a human-oriented approach will put the first one into practice. At this point, the fact that the economic units in the Ahi system always consist of household businesses and their purpose is limited to making a living instead of capital accumulation must be a significant economic attitude for today. It can be thought that this approach should be considered as a stimulus for the development of family businesses today.

As K. Galbraith points out, although today’s Capitalist market economy has essentially solved the problem of production, it has not been able to solve the problem of distribution (Ölmezoğulları, 2003: 86). Therefore, all the criticisms directed to this system are concentrated at this point. In order not to cause such an injustice, it is not recommended to hide, that is to claim, unnecessary surplus capital, known as under the pillow, in the Futuwetname, which includes the principles of Ahilik. To remind, according to this idea, which is based on the practice of zakat in the Islamic belief, the person who owns an unnecessary 81 gr gold worth of property is ordered to give zakat at the rate of 1/40 of this. The purpose of this is to render the income distribution fair by not allowing the capital to be collected in certain hands (Karagül, 2012: 5).

The understanding of perfect competition, which is the most basic principle of the Liberal Capitalist system in practice today, is a method that is relatively impossible to apply and accept, as none of the conditions of atomized, homogeneity,
mobility and openness are in the real world, as can be seen in Introduction to Economics. Therefore, there is no doubt that the domination of the principle of perfect competition, whose preconditions are not fulfilled, in the national and international markets will cause the weak to be crushed and destroyed against the strong.

However, the goal in the Ahi thought was not to oppress the weak from the market in the name of competition, but to protect the weak against the strong. In this sense, instead of the competition envisaged by the liberal system, the Ahi understanding aims to establish solidarity, solidarity and cooperation in the society with the understanding of "let live to live". It has implemented this with the aid system expressed as the middle fund.

Today, considering the place and role of national and international banks in the eyes of the state and the nation, it will be much better understood how necessary and appropriate the middle fund application is in the face of financial threat and financial burden on the public and individuals.

There is no doubt that poverty is one of the main economic problems in today’s world. In addition, it is a known fact that the most troubled economic problems of the underdeveloped countries are the insufficiency of capital and the problem of foreign debt. As a matter of fact, the basic condition for the elimination of poverty and the solution of all these problems is to spread the capital to the base. In realizing this, the claim is that the excess capital The importance of a system that prohibits accumulation cannot be denied. (Erdem, 2008: 63). Accumulating wealth in some hands is untenable while basic needs remain.

6. Destruction Of The Moral Organization

The Ahi Organization, which continued its activities successfully from the last years of the Seljuk State to the last period of the Ottoman Empire, lost its effectiveness gradually in the 17th and 19th centuries due to many different factors, as in all social events. It should not be wrong to state that the following factors were effective in the collapse of the Ahi Community, which had extremely positive motives in economic and social life (Erdem, 2008).

Due to the weakening of the state institution, all institutions and organizations within it started to lose their effectiveness, with the increase of migration from the village to the city, people who have not received ahi-order education, open a business in the city, in the same period, the Ahi Organization could not keep up with the industrialization process in Europe, with the capitulations that started with Suleiman the Magnificent, the replacement of domestic producers and their products by foreign producers and goods, while the moral meltdown in the society caused the tradesmen to move away from the Futuwvet name principles, this caused the citizens to lose their trust in the tradesmen.

In addition, with the "Reform Edict" published by Abdülmecit I in 1856, the state enabled all its nationals to freely do all kinds of arts, crafts, trade and
professions. Accordingly, the practice of "Gedik Charter", which has been applied since 1727 and grants its owners the authority and privilege to make production and trade in the relevant field, ended in 1860. With all these developments, the Ahi Organization lost its functionality, and finally, with a law enacted in 1912, the Ahi establishment was completely abolished.

D. CONCLUSION

As can be seen, the Ahi Organization, within the framework of the duties it assumed in its time, today is the chambers of industry and commerce, the union of tradesmen and craftsmen, labor and employer unions, Turkish Standards Institute, etc. Along with many economic institutions, it successfully carried out the activities of many institutions such as the Ministry of National Education, the Ministry of Labor and Social Security and the Turkish Armed Forces. This system, in which working, labor and capital peace, keeping the environment clean, producing quality goods, educating young people, producer-consumer, state-nation and all members of the society are at peace, has played a very important role in the establishment of the socio-economic order in Anatolia (Öztürk, 2011).

We have to state that an understanding based on trust, not confrontational, lies behind the ability of a single institution to carry out the tasks that dozens of institutions fail to carry out today. Today, in the name of protecting the employee, it is necessary to question well what the employee has achieved from the confrontational bargaining made by the employer on the one hand and the labor union on the other.

Another important issue that needs to be emphasized is the contribution of the Ahi-order institution to the development of Ottoman civil society. In Ottoman society, a much more successful guild and even civil society organization to a certain extent was realized than its examples in the West. The Ahis could also be the voice of the civil will in the country. However, the Ottoman administration gave many rights that were not in its own merchants to Western merchants, with the 1838 Balta Port Agreement and Capillary, and thus punished its own citizens, and thus the Ahi institution and tradesmen unions became unable to compete against Western merchants. This situation caused both themselves and the Ottoman economy to suffer a great blow (Karagöz, 2011).

It is a fact that the widespread use of commemoration programs on the Ahi community in our country is a promising development for our future. However, in order to obtain concrete results from these programs, first of all, the current capitalist understanding of life, which is dominant in our country and does not comply with our value judgments, adopts the principle of individualism rather than sociality, profit rather than benefit, accumulation rather than sharing, luxury consumption rather than production, and abolition by competition instead of supporting the weak. We have to reconsider our relationship and put forward our own ethical existence.
In this context, value judgments that differ from society's own cultural codes should be restored to their original state. Because the behavior patterns of societies are fed by their value judgments. So at least in society; We are of the opinion that there is not much that can be done unless the owner of knowledge sees as much value as the owner of knowledge, as much as the consumer who produces, as much as the silent speaker, as much as the ignorant who knows, as well as the modest insolent, the faithful unfaithful. As a result, it is necessary to re-examine our relationship with the capitalist system, which aims at the wealth of the individual rather than society, and the understanding of the state it imposes.

REFERENCES